

Standing Committee for the Humanities
(SCH)

**ESF Exploratory Workshop on
Reinventions of Early-European
Performing Arts and the Creative City,
Civic Regeneration and Cultural Tourism**

Budapest (Hungary), 9-12 September 2012

Convened by:
**Pamela King, Jane Davidson, Nils Holger Petersen,
and Erik Hitters**

SCIENTIFIC REPORT

1.

Executive summary

The workshop took place over two days in the Gellner Room, Central European University, Budapest. Twenty-three delegates participated, including three substitutes, from an invitation list of twenty-nine. Those attending came from eleven different countries, ten of them European, the eleventh Australia because of the workshop's link-up with the Centre of Excellence for the Study of the History of Emotions there, funded by ARC, who contributed to the funding of the workshop. Three of the originally invited delegates pulled out at short notice because of conflicting commitments, Susan Broomhall (Australia) sent a substitute (Rebecca Miller, (Crawley, W.Australia)), Jacqueline Van Gent's (Australia) material was included in Philippa Maddern's presentation, and Peter Knatchbull-Hugessen (Coventry UK) sent electronic information about the Coventry Festival which was circulated after the event. Manuel Gomez Lara (Seville, Spain) was unable to attend because of a serious injury sustained on the eve of his departure to join us, but he sent through an electronic synopsis of his planned presentation which was delivered by Pamela King. Two others (Greg Richards (Tilburg, Netherlands) and Jean Michel Verneiges (Aisne, France) pulled out at longer notice and sessions were reorganised accordingly with substitutes (Katerina Antonenko (Russia/Denmark) and Frances Eustace (Bristol, UK)), while only one further invited delegate (Leonore Scholze Irrlitz (Berlin, Germany)) failed to attend without communicating with the organisers at all. Thus we effectively had contributions from twenty-seven people covering all the originally planned areas of expertise.

Proceedings began with an informal get-together on the evening before the workshop began, when newly arriving delegates joined those who had attended the preceding meeting of CARMEN (Co-operative for the Advancement of Research through a Medieval European Network). The fact of the workshop's following this meeting led to the inclusion of some unfunded participants in our deliberations, particularly as a session on "Creative Cities" at the CARMEN meeting, and led by Pamela King, fed into later discussions. Thus the opening evening as a transition between two linked events enabled initial introductions and informal networking to take place which contributed to the strong start to the formal proceedings. As a venue, therefore, the CEU provided a context in which participants in the Workshop were able to explore instantly the dissemination of ideas, and next steps, with a dozen key global scholars who though present did not draw on ESF funds.

Delegates were spread across a number of hotels adjacent to the University. Lunches and dinners were organised, with the help of administrative staff of the Department of Medieval Studies at CEU, in a range of local inexpensive restaurants offering traditional Hungarian cuisine. This and a reception accompanied by a local group of medieval singers on the evening between the two days' discussion, greatly enhanced the atmosphere of the whole event, particularly as our discussions revolved around current uses of regional traditions as agents in cultural tourism. The meals, all taken at single large tables, as well as generous tea and coffee breaks, meant that there was ample opportunity for informal exchange, something borne out by the volume of email traffic involving future collaborations and plans amongst the group subsequent to the meeting.

Given that the group was very disparate, including six historians, two sociologists, three festival organisers, four arts practitioners, two publishers, one archivist, four theatre historians, and one church historian/liturgist, impressive amounts of common ground were discovered, and the atmosphere, though occasionally combative, was facilitative and lively. One of the festival organisers subsequently summarised the effect in an email which reads: "Our few days in Budapest were the first time in an age that I have had the opportunity to sit, listen and think about what it is we do here in York. I thank Pamela King for that opportunity and all of you for your contributions. The chance to be part of this network has come at the

ideal time for us and I hope that I can play a full part as a practitioner. What I heard and saw during the workshops will very much have an influence on the shape of our 2014 production and the direction in which I would now hope to take our organisation. Perhaps by 2014 we will be clearer on the outcome of the work done in Budapest and maybe York can provide a venue for the next stage and offer itself as one of the experiments.”

The objectives of the meeting were addressed by uniting those who research the original civic festivals of the Middle Ages and their revival across a wide and contrastive variety of regional and national contexts. Brought together with them were sociologists who look at how the arts contribute to the cultural and economic capital of cities, a group of people who either produce or perform in modern reinventions and revivals of the performance arts of the Middle Ages, and others who are professionally tasked to preserve and promulgate information about these festivals. These groups conventionally have little contact with one another, and, in particular, the producers and practitioners enjoy an often tense relationship with researchers who are seen as purists looking for authenticity without themselves ever facing the real-life situations the producers are working with. Typically producers and performers are vitally concerned with the aesthetic demands of their present-day audiences, with bringing in profits, often for charities, and with complying with modern regulatory frameworks, whereas for the researcher the performance itself is essentialised. The workshop went a long way towards breaking down these barriers and showing practitioners ways in which access to academic expertise can enhance and refresh their work, while researchers are led to consider the expedient demands of modern performance contexts. The sociologists – neither of them experts in the medieval performing arts -provided analytical data about the ways in which cultural activities in general enhance civic life and prosperity, and the measurability of those benefits. The archivist highlighted the need to preserve ephemeral records for the benefit not only of researchers but informing new production initiatives. The conclusion of the meeting was that the various groups represented did have much to offer not only to one another in a network of knowledge exchange, but that the joint expertise of the group was greater than its parts, offering not only opportunities for new interdisciplinary research projects, but for the formation of a consultancy service able to assist civic authorities in devising new festive opportunities based around medieval themes, from supplying customised scripts and scores to providing budgetary and marketing models. The specific new research questions and practical challenges that the Workshop defined are listed in more detail below.

2. Scientific content of the event

Gábor Klaniczay opened proceedings with an exploratory talk on the ways in which images and understandings of the Middle Ages are both used in Central and Eastern European understandings of heritage, but are also open to abuse in political contexts, particularly by right wing militaristic and racist groups seeking to construct claims to ethnic superiority and purity. The theme of how medieval festivals can be appropriated to different ideologies was later taken up by Trpimir Vedriš, and was extended into a consideration of the typology of festivals and their claims to “traditional” origins, exploring geographical distribution – concentrated in recent war zones – and on who are the organisers, and who the participants. He also introduced the subject of how traditional festivals self-censor to exclude elements which are ethically unacceptable to the modern audience, which gave rise to discussion. These speakers provoked chiefly requests for further information, but also and importantly opened up a general awareness that the Middle Ages can never be assumed to be a neutral site for celebratory activity. These issues were developed further by the practitioners Björn Ross and Gro Siri Johansen who discussed how in fashioning mixed-media avant garde performance events based on the manipulation of medieval materials – frescos, dance, music and narrative – aesthetic considerations were always tempered by the nature and contexts of the audience. For example, Johansen reported how she had to adapt a planned performance which coincided with the immediate aftermath of the atrocities committed in Oslo and Utoya by Anders Behring Breivik. The group explored in discussion the balance of responsibilities in any reconstructed or reinvented event to aesthetic quality, “authenticity”, and to opening up the idea of the Middle Ages in ways that resist such abuses.

The synchronic perspective introduced by these speakers was balanced against the analysis of diachronic case studies by Pamela King, Anu Mänd, Bart Ramakers, and by the communication sent by Manuel Gomez-Lara, prevented by injury for attending. King explored recently discovered records of revived medieval plays in the context of radical leftist theatre in London in the aftermath of World War I, and how this drama was appropriated to the cause of educating working people, as well as to the suffragette movement and radical Christian groups. As a scholar of medieval drama, Ramakers voiced anxieties about inappropriate and ill-informed reconstructions of the material, while also questioning why the Netherlands, with its unparalleled rich tradition of medieval playing has very little apparent appetite for events of the nature under discussion. Mänd described how Estonia, with its fractured traditions, is fruitfully exploiting its medieval past through performance events, now being owned by the Estonian population, although originally generated by the foreign German, Swedish and Russian ruling elites. Gomez Lara’s communication explored the intertwining of two superficially antagonistic traditions in Seville, the religious *Semana Santa* processions which have continued since the Middle Ages and incorporate material elements from as early as the seventeenth century, and the nineteenth-century “*Feria de Abril*”, originally a cattle market, and purely secular and commercial. He explored how the city authorities very soon promoted the latter for its festive nature, appealing to images which were being internationally spread by the romantic travellers, and how the two festivals have become unselfconsciously intertwined by their sharing of the same season of the year and the built environment. He summarised further how the composite festival has thus survived and adapted through the collapse of old social structures (guilds, religious organizations, political institutions) and its impact on the material elements of the festivals, the antiquarian revival of 19th century travellers and the romantic construction of the South, and the growth of modernism and the redefinition of the ornamental, drawing new boundaries for the ceremonial city. Discussion of these disparate examples further problematised ideas of “authenticity”.

Musicians and musicologists Andrew Lawrence-King and Katerina Antonenko introduced further considerations of how the practitioner engaged in reconstructing a medieval performance event has to commit to a single understanding of the original, current at the moment of the event's re-conception, unlike the scholar who can balance conflicting interpretations. Their presentation gave rise to very lively debate, led by early musician Frances Eustace, and musicologist and liturgy scholar, Nils Holger Petersen whose roles throughout the first day's proceedings were in managing and facilitating events, Petersen taking the chair in discussion sessions. Academic drama tutor, Philip Butterworth offered a model of how he inducts students into being conscious of creative control through considerations of choice, length, perceived difficulty and challenge of material; through reflection on the purpose ascribed to the choice of material and the vision of what the new production will do with it; through considering how production decisions are communicated to the company in relation to dimensions of the performance context, acknowledging the strengths and weaknesses of the individual participants, and introducing checks throughout the preparation process that the identified purpose and perceived value of the project remains in focus.

Considerations of audience were singled out as an increasing focus for discussion, as Philippa Maddern picked up on, and further analysed the effects on a modern audience of Lawrence-King's production from the perspective of the research parameters of the Centre for Excellence for the History of the Emotions. Jane Davidson further elaborated on this discussion by introducing the methodologies of systematised exploration of the cognitive processes engaged by modern audience members present at a performance of medieval music drama. The three festival directors present acted as a counter to theorised analysis by providing empirical evidence of how the events to which they are committed engage with different aspects of the host community. Roger Lee described the evolution of the York Festival of Mystery Plays and how it continues to strive to enhance the productions it offers its audience while answering the city's expectations that what they see will continue to conform to the popularly received image of their unique tradition, working in an environment increasingly populated by heritage events. Phil McCormick described how in the new Gloucester Mystery Plays Festival the idea of the Middle Ages has prompted a wide variety of responses and offers of performance and re-enactment events. He argued for the economic benefit of pursuing an inclusive policy, and judiciously harnessing sponsorship and patronage where it is offered, in order to maximise the income for a Festival's beneficiary be that city, charity, or in Gloucester's case, the cathedral. Discussion further considered how Gloucester, as a medieval city, has tapped into a ready popular imaginary despite the fact that, unlike York, it has no medieval records of equivalent events. This discussion was further extended by the late but welcome intervention of substitute delegate Rebecca Miller who described her initiative in turning the celebration of the anniversary of a historic shipwreck in a small and isolated Australian coastal town into a festival had allowed that community to coalesce around ideas of European heritage and difference, of community identity. The demonstrable social and economic benefit that the event had added to the town, which could simply have erected a commemorative plaque, pulled enthusiastic discussion of the value of festivals based on the medieval past into sharp focus.

Many of the questions emerging from discussion about the interventions of those with specialised knowledge/experience of medieval festivals were crystallised by the contributions of our two non-medievalist social scientists. Erik Hitters talked in general terms about the commodification of culture as cities face a crisis of legitimisation of their cultural activity in a competitive environment. He looked in detail at the statistical information that is available on impact as a factor of the scale and duration of events. He pointed out that the ambition to generate substantial tourist flow is a priority for cities that use festivals as part of their cultural and regeneration policies, pointing out how tourism has turned many traditional

participatory festivals into non-participatory spectacles, observing that what is needed is more research on the impact of tourism on events as much as the impact of events on tourism. He further observed that ideas of the creative city are frequently restricted to planners, excluding ephemeral events, urging that all impacts, direct and indirect, of festivals should be attributable. Volker Kirchberg then described a project in mapping museum experience, indicating ways in which its methodologies could be deployed in relation to medieval festivals. He described the technological equipment that is available to measure the emotional impact of events on audiences and participants, and the real possibility of scientifically measuring responses to cultural events, coining the term “imagineering”.

Jo Elsworth provided the archivist’s perspective, illustrating to practitioners and scholars alike the extensive intelligence available from archival records of previous festivals, but also, and more critically, indicating that in order to facilitate future scholarly analysis and to provide blueprints for future festivals, all records of ephemeral current events should be formally conserved in the public domain. Loes Diercken represented a scholarly publisher interested in reflecting an emerging field of study. Simon Forde and Claire McIlroy acted as recorders of the extended discussion and helped the Principal Investigators to pull discussion together and formulate outcomes.

3. Assessment of the results, contribution to the future direction of the field, outcome

The Workshop generated a number of underpinning research questions which are being deployed in the formulation of continuing research projects and partnerships, probably, but not exclusively investigating COST actions, as well as funding available from for example the AHRC in Britain, and the Australian Research Council:-

- Why do these festivals happen?
- What is their role in their owning communities, and for what reasons do participants invest/engage in medieval festivals?
- How do heritage performance festivals relate to, and engage with, audience perceptions of local history and identity?
- How do references to the medieval past contribute to the recuperation and construction of cultural memory, and act as agents of social cohesion?
- How do medieval festivals engage disparate civic identities?
- What is it that medieval festivals have in common in the European tradition, or do continuous vs fractured vs conflicted traditions have distinct taxonomies?
- What are the parameters for selection within the typology of medieval festivals?
- How do institutional contingencies affect the construction of medieval festivals?
- How much are medieval festivals contributing measurably to the economic wellbeing of cities and their regions?
- What do medieval arts festivals offer in the 21st century and how are they enjoyed, and why have so many been instigated since the millennium?

Additionally, because of the presence of a number of practitioners at the workshop, further research challenges were identified, some of which will contribute to the formulation of academic research projects as mentioned above, but others of which are already seeking private sector funding as part of reflective knowledge-exchange for the development of further civic festivals, including placement opportunities for doctoral and post-doctoral students:-

- Devising a mapping process of the typology
- Sharing models of successful practice
- Helping organisers/creators optimise their offerings
- Creating new linkages between research and practice
- Activating archives to get the archive out of the festival as well as to feed archive-based intelligence into the festival
- Using evidence of past events to understand and inform current festivals and to create future festivals – from all participants point of view

Across both the above categories it was agreed that the following was the workshop's list of desired outputs/deliverables:-

- A mapping exercise of primary archived accessible evidence of mediievally-influenced performance events including the traditional, reinvented, and invented, undertaken across a time period and a geographical space
- The generation and support of more successful civic festivals inspired by ideas of the medieval past
- The creation of a sustainable model to enable festivals to become self-funding and to generate funding for further research

- The creation and funding of cross-sectoral, and public/private partnership research placements
- Protection of our intangible cultural heritage by the documentation of current festivals for future record

A website initiative, instigated by the participating festival producers in the business sector in the UK is already underway, and a festival consultancy including practitioners, academic advisers, and marketing specialists will shortly be trialled.

4. Final programme

Sunday, 9 September 2012

Afternoon *Arrival*

19.00 *Get-together, with food, at the First Strudel House of Pest*

Monday, 10 September 2012

08.00-09.00 *Arrival, Registration, Coffee*

09.15-10.00 Welcome by Convenor (including introduction to the ESF)
Pamela King (Professor of Medieval Studies, University of Bristol, UK)

Medievalism, Re-invented Cults and National Sentiment: a Central European Perspective
Gabor Klaniczay (Professor of Medieval Studies, CEU, Budapest, Hungary)

10.30-17.30 Midday Sessions: Stakeholders in Early Performance Arts

10.30-11.15 Presentation 1 'Civic Drama & Performance in Europe: revivals and survivals'
Bart Ramakers (Prof. of Hist. Dutch Literature, Rijksuniv. Groningen, NL)
Anu Mänd (Sen. Res. Fellow, Medieval Studies, Inst. of History, Tallinn, Estonia)
Manuel J. Gómez-Lara (Profesor Titular, Universidad de Sevilla, Spain) UNWELL – PK will give brief contextual report

11.15-11.45 Presentation 2 'Historical Paradigms: Re-inventions in the UK, 1918 to Today'
Pamela King
Philip Butterworth (Inst. for Medieval Studies, University of Leeds, UK)

11.45-12.00 Agenda setting for Round Tables

12.00-13.30 *Lunch in CEU Refectory*

13.30-14.30 Round-Table A 'Civic Re-inventions of Early Performance Today: Problems and Perspectives'
Roger Lee (York Guilds & Chairman, York Festival Trust, UK)
Gro Siri Johansen (Director, Modus: senter for middelaldemusikk, Oslo, Norway)

Phil McCormick (Gloucester Mystery Plays, UK)

14.30-15.00 Questions and Discussion, led by Nils Holger Petersen (Professor of Church History, University of Copenhagen, DK)

15.00-15.30 *Coffee / Tea break*

15.30-16.15 Round-Table B 'Museums, Publishers and Public Outreach'
Jo Elsworth (Director, Theatre Collection, University of Bristol, UK)
Loes Diercken (Brepols Publishers, Turnhout, Belgium)

- 16.15-17.00 Questions and Discussion, led by Nils Holger Petersen
- 17.00- 19.15 *Dinner at a restaurant in the vicinity of CEU*
- 19.30-21.30 Evening Session: Research Directions in Re-inventions in Medieval Music Theatre
- 19.30-19.40 Presentation 1 'Early Music – a contemporary art practice in disguise'
Bjorn Ross (Copenhagen Renaissance Music Festival, Nordic network for early opera)
- 19.40-19.50 Presentation 2 'Medieval Music Theatre in Modern Cultural Tourism'
Rebecca Millar (Centre of Excellence for the History of the Emotions, UWA, Australia)
- 19.50-20.00 Presentation 3 'Eliding Space and Time :authenticity and audience in recreating the *Ludus Danielis*'
Philippa Maddern (Centre of Excellence for the History of the Emotions, UWA, Australia)
- 20.00-20.20 Presentation 4 'Performing Medieval Music Theatre: *Ludus Danielis*'
Andrew Lawrence-King and Katerina Antonenko (Det kongelige danske Musikkonservatorium, Denmark)
- 20.20-20.30 Presentation 5 'A cognitive Perspective on Spectating Medieval Music Theatre'
Jane Davidson (Centre of Excellence for the History of the Emotions, UWA, Australia)
- 20.30-20.45 Questions and Discussion led by Nils Holger Petersen and Frances Eustace
- 21.30 *Reception, Early Music Performance, and informal networking time*

Tuesday, 11 September 2012

- 08.30-10.30 Morning Session: Historical Performing Arts and the Creative City
- 08.30-08.45 Presentation 1 'Arts and Urban Regeneration: comparing cases from Europe and the USA'
Volker Kirchberg (Professor in Applied Cultural Studies, Inst. Für Kulturtheorie, Kulturforschung und Kunst, Leuphana Universität, Lüneburg, Germany)
- 08.45-09.00 Presentation 3 'Creative Clusters and Media Cities'
Erik Hitters (Associate Professor of Media and Cultural Industries, Erasmus University, NL)
- 09.00-09.15 Presentation 4 'The Impact of Early Performance in Central Europe'
Trpimir Vedriš (Department of History, University of Zagreb, Croatia)
- 09.15-10.00 Questions and Discussion, led by Erik Hitters
- 10.00-10.30 *Coffee*
- 10.30-12.00 Midday Session: Maximising and Quantifying Social Impact
- 10.30-11.00 Round-table C 'Towards a Historical Performing Arts Powerhouse: SITM (Société Internationale pour l'Étude du Théâtre Médiéval),

CHE (Centre for the History of the Emotions), and CARMEN (Co-operative for the Advancement of Research through a Medieval European Network) convened by
Pamela King, Simon Forde, Philippa Maddern

- 11.00-11.30 Round-table D 'Quantifying Social Impact: Social Sciences Lessons for the Humanities' convened by Erik Hitters and Volker Kirchberg
- 11.30-12.00 Questions and Discussion
- 12.00-13.30 *Lunch*
- 13.30-16.30 Afternoon Session: Next Steps to Marie-Curie and COST
- 13.30-14.00 Background to funding opportunities, and aims of the closing session
Pamela King, Nils Holger Petersen, Jane Davidson, Erik Hitters
- 14.00-15.30 Discussion on follow-up steps/gaps in coverage/further collaboration, and requirements of Marie-Curie and COST Actions, chaired by Simon Forde with Claire McIlroy and Frances Eustace
- 15.30-16.00 *Coffee/Tea break*
- 16.00-16.30 Concluding words and thanks: Pamela King
- 16.30 *Informal networking time*
- 19.00 *Concluding dinner*

Wednesday, 12 September 2012

morning *Departure*

5. Final list of participants

1. **Pamela KING**
School of Humanities
University of Bristol
2. **Jane DAVIDSON**
School of Music
The University of Western Australia
3. **Nils Holger PETERSEN**
Department of Church History
University of Copenhagen
4. **Erik HITTERS**
Department of Media and
Communication
Erasmus University Rotterdam
5. **Jo ELSWORTH**
Curator of the Theatre Collection
University of Bristol
6. **Gabor KLANICZAY**
Department of Medieval Studies,
Central European University,
Budapest
7. **Phil BUTTERWORTH**
Department of Drama,
University of Leeds
8. **Rebecca Millar**
ARC Centre of Excellence for the
History of Emotions
The University of Western Australia
9. **Simon FORDE**
Executive Director,
CARMEN
10. **Claire MCILROY**
Academic Policy Services
The University of Western Australia
11. **Roger LEE**
York Festival Trust
York, UK
12. **Phil MCCORMICK**
Theatre Gloucestershire
Gloucester, UK
13. **Bart RAMAKERS**
Department of Historical Dutch
Literature
University of Groningen, Netherlands
14. **Anu MÄND**
Institute of History
Tallinn University
15. **Andrew LAWRENCE-KING**
Det Kongelige danske
Musikkonsertorium
Denmark
16. **Katerina ANTONENKO**
Det Kongelige danske
Musikkonsertorium
Denmark
17. **Trpimir VEDRIS**
Filozofski fakultet Sveučilišta u
Zagrebu
Croatia
18. **Gro Siri Ognoy JOHANSEN**
Modus: senter for middelaldermusikk
Oslo
19. **Loes DIERCKEN**
Brepols Publishers NV
Turnhout, Belgium
20. **Volker KIRCHBERG**
Inst. Für Kulturtheorie, Kulturforschung
und Kunst
Leuphana Universität Germany
21. **Björn ROSS**
(independent artist) København
Denmark
22. **Philippa MADDERN**
ARC Centre of Excellence for the
History of Emotions
The University of Western Australia
23. **Frances EUSTACE**
Centre for Medieval Studies,
University of Bristol,

6. Statistical information on participants

Gender: of the 23 participants, 12 were male, 11 female.

Age: 2x20s; 3x30s; 8x40s; 8x50s; 2x60s.

Country: Hungary 1, Croatia 1, Estonia 1, Russia/Denmark 1, Denmark 3, Norway 1, Netherlands 2, Germany 1, Belgium 2, Australia 4, UK 6.