

ESF Member Organisation Forum on "Peer Review"

International Workshop, 06 December 2011

COST Office Brussels, Belgium

Draft Agenda

International Workshop Peer Review: future challenges for research funding and performing organisations in selecting research excellence

Objectives

The main objective of the workshop is to discuss key issues and challenges in Peer Review common to research funding organisations. The conference will also provide an opportunity to present the European Peer Review Guide, as a significant contribution in this direction resulted from the MO Forum on Peer Review.

The workshop will focus on the following 4 topics:

- 1. Peer Review of Pluridisciplinary Research
- 2. Use of Bibliometrics in Peer Review
- 3. Quality assurance in Peer Review
- 4. Defining and Measuring Broader Impact

Therefore the Workshop should address common issues and challenges in Peer Review in the European landscape, with the addition of International peer review practices regarding the above topics. Some of these topics are the subject of on-going research in their respective fields of science, however, for the purposes of this conference, these should be addressed from the Funding Agencies and Research Councils perspectives and informed by the latest development on these fronts.

Agenda

Monday, 05 December 2011

19.30 Welcome Reception at "Basil & Co", Avenue Louise, 156

Tuesday, 06 December 2011 – Day 1

- 09.00 Welcome and Introduction
- 09.20 Roundtable presentations
- 09.35 The ESF Member Organisation Forum on Peer Review Laura Marin, European Science Foundation
- 10.00 The European Peer Review Guide: pillars of good practice Laura Marin , European Science Foundation
- 10.45 *Coffee break*

11.05 PARALLEL SESSION 1

1.1 Broader Impact

Introduction by Moderator: Alan Cross, European Commission Rapporteur: Jimmy-Bruun Felthaus, European Commission

- "Broader impact and the upcoming HORIZON2020 programme", Alan Cross, European Commission
- "Broader Impacts and the Accountability of Science" by Robert Frodeman, University of North Texas, USA
- "Evaluating the broader impact in EU Framework Programmes: experiences from FP6 and FP7" Manfred Horvat, Vienna University of Technology, Austria

Debate .30 Lunch

12.30 Lunch

PARALLEL SESSION 2

2.1 Quality assurance

(Finland)

Introduction by Moderator: Jonas Björck, VR (Sweden) Rapporteur: Risto Vilkko, The Academy of Finland,

- "Challenges to Quality Assurance: The Problem of Bias", by David Shatz, Yeshiva University, USA
- "Gender Observations of the evaluation process

 what gender patterns can be found and how
 can they be fed back to the organization" by
 Johanna Andersson, Chalmers University,
 Sweden
- "Quality Assurance in Peer Review" by Anne-Marie Coriat, Medical Research Council, UK
 Debate

AFTERNOON SESSIONS

13.30 PARALLEL SESSION 1

1.2 Use of Bibliometrics Introduction by Moderator: Valerio Vercesi, INFN (Italy) Rapporteur: Thomas Zimmerman, SNF (Switzerland)

- "Use of Bibliometrics in Peer Review" by Gunnar Sivertsen, NIFU (Nordic Institute for Studies in Innovation, Research and Education), Norway
- "Research Policy and Funding Mechanism in Korea: Focusing on Bibliometrics and Peer Review" by Jung Cheol Shin, Seoul National University, South Korea
- "Bibliometrics in China" by Ping Zhou, Institute of Scientific and Technical Information of China, China
- "It's not how you measure it's what you measure" by Fiona Wood, University of New England, Australia
 Debate

PARALLEL SESSION 2 2.2 Pluridisciplinarity

Introduction by Moderator: **Catherine Kistner**, DFG (Germany) Rapporteur: **Stephen Simpson**, SFI (Ireland)

- "Peer-review and Interdisciplinary research at the ERC" by Monique Smaihi, European Research Council Executive Agency
- "Research funding and peer review system in JSPS" Yozo Fujino, Department of Civil Engineering, University of Tokyo, Japan
- "Approaches and challenges for multidisciplinary evaluation". Paulo Sérgio Lacerda Beirão, Director of Ciências Agrárias, Biológicas e da Saúde, Brazil

Debate

- 16.00 Coffee break
- 16.15 **Plenary: Report back from the parallel sessions** (Rapporteur's Reports & Discussion) *Moderated by* Laura Marin, *European Science Foundation*
- 17.30 Wrap Up & Closing Remarks
- 18.00 End of Workshop
- 19.30 Dinner at Restaurant "Le Malte" rue Berckmans, 30